Guidelines for establishing a Thesis Defense Committee for the Doctoral School InfoMaths

February 13, 2019

This document is intended for doctoral students preparing to defend their dissertation and provides the necessary guidelines for establishing a Thesis Defense Committee (or Jury) in accordance with the requirements imposed by both the Doctoral School and the Graduate School (exempt the case of a co-tutelle or international joint supervision of a thesis).

1 Composition of the jury

The composition of the Thesis Defense Committee or Jury must conform to the following guidelines which are imposed by the Doctoral School, the Graduate School of the Institution of enrolment and the ministerial order of the 25th of May 2016 which establishes the national framework for the deliverance of the doctorate degree in France:

https://www.legifrance.gouv.fr/affichTexte.do?cidTexte=JORFTEXT0000032587086

1. The composition of the Thesis Defense Committee is comprised of at least four (4) members and at most eight (8) members.

2. The ministerial order requires that at least half of the members of the Thesis Defense Committee be French or foreign scholars who are in no way affiliated with either the Doctoral School or the Institution of enrolment, and who were chosen for their scientific expertise in the subject area of the dissertation.

Important: In order to avoid any potential conflict of interest, the Doctoral School InfoMaths further requires that:

- At least half of the members of the thesis defense committee not belong to any of the research units coordinated by the Doctoral School, nor belong to any of the research units affiliated with the institution of enrolment, nor be part of the company (in the case of a CIFRE thesis) where the work was realised. In order to ensure the independence of the external members of the Thesis Defense Committee and of the scholarly output produced by the doctoral student, it is important that the Application for Thesis Defense include a complete list
of the scholarly work produced by the student (publications, preprint, conference presentations...) with full and accurate bibliographic references citing all co-authors.

- The Thesis Defense Committee must include at least one thesis reviewer.

3. At least half of the members of the Thesis Defense Committee must be comprised of Professors or assimilated personnel in the sense of Article 6 of the decree 92-70 relative to the Conseil National des Universités or of academic scholars of equivalent rank who do not depend on the French Ministry of Higher Education. The Application for Thesis Defense must include the rank and academic affiliation of all members of the Thesis Defense Committee.

4. The president of the Thesis Defense Committee is required to be at the rank of Professor or assimilated personnel or of equivalent rank in case of foreign individuals. The president of the Thesis Defense Committee is nominated on the day of the dissertation defense by the members of the committee. A professor emeritus may be president of the Thesis Defense Committee so long as it does not involve his own student.

5. The thesis advisor(s) may be included as an official member of the Thesis Defense Committee, although this is not a requirement. The advisor(s) may be considered an invited member of the jury. In case the advisor(s) is counted as an official member of the jury, he or she may participate in the jury, sign the PV (final minutes of the deliberation) and the thesis defence report, but in no way participates in the deliberations nor the final decision.

6. Under exceptional circumstances, the members of the Thesis Defense Committee (excluding the president) may participate via videoconferencing.

7. The composition of the Thesis Defense Committee must respect the following guidelines established independently by each academic Institution with respect to the participation of both men and women in the jury:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Université Lyon 1</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of members</td>
<td>Allowable configurations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 members</td>
<td>2 males–2 females</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 members</td>
<td>2 males–3 females or vice versa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 members</td>
<td>3 males–3 females or 2 males–4 females or vice versa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 members</td>
<td>3 males–4 females or vice versa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 members</td>
<td>4 males–4 females or 3 males–5 females or vice versa</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>INSA de Lyon</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of members</td>
<td>Allowable configurations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4, 5 or 6 members</td>
<td>at least one female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 or 8 members</td>
<td>at least two females</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ENS de Lyon – École Centrale de Lyon</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of members</td>
<td>Allowable configurations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4, 5, 6 or 7 members</td>
<td>at least one female</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8 members</td>
<td>at least two females</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Université Lyon 2</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of members</td>
<td>Allowable configurations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>from 4 to 8 members</td>
<td>at least 40% females and at least 40% males</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Lyon 3 is expected to follow the same guidelines as those imposed by Lyon 1.

8. For the Université Claude Bernard LYON 1:
   • At least 4 members of the Thesis Defense Committee including one external member and
     the president must be physically present for the dissertation defense. If this condition is not
     met, the dissertation defense will be invalidated.
   • The thesis advisor(s) shall not be secretary (or minute taker of the deliberations), nor be
     president of the Thesis Defense Committee.
   • The Thesis Defense Committee must include at least one faculty member of UCBL pos-
     sessing an HDR and external to the direction of the thesis authorised to participate in the
     deliberations and whose physical presence is required on the day of the defense.

9. For INSA: The Thesis Defense Committee must include at least one faculty member from the
   Institution of enrolment possessing an HDR and whose physical presence is required on the day
   of the defense.

NB: Role of the Invited Members of the Jury: The notion of an invited member of the jury has no legal
basis on the dissertation defense. Invited members are forbidden from participating in all deliberations.

2 Thesis reviewers

The thesis reviewers must be in possession of an HDR or be of equivalent academic rank in case of
foreign individuals. They must belong to an academic institution of higher education or research and to
one of the following categories:

   • At the rank of Professor or assimilated personnel in the sense of Article 6 of the decree ° 92-70
     relative to the Conseil National des Universités or be an academic scholar of equivalent rank who
     does not depend on the French Ministry of Higher Education.
   • Personnels belonging to an academic institution of higher education or a public research organi-
     sation, and habilitated to direct research.
   • In possession of a doctorate (Ph.D.) and chosen on the basis of their scientific expertise in the
     subject area of the dissertation.
   • The reviewers are designated by the head of the Institution based on recommendations by the di-
     rector of the Doctoral School and the thesis advisor(s). The reviewers must in no way be affiliated
     with the institution of enrolment nor belong to any of the research units coordinated by the Doc-
     toral School, nor belong to any of the research units affiliated with the institution of enrolment,
     nor be part of the company (in the case of a CIFRE thesis) where the work was realised.
   • The reviewers are not to have collaborated with the doctoral student nor taken part in the doctoral
     training or mentorship.
   • A professor emeritus may be a reviewer so long as it does not involve his own student.
Please feel free to contact the Doctoral School for any additional information:

École Doctorale InfoMaths (ED 512),
INSA de Lyon - Bâtiment Blaise Pascal - 3ème étage - Bureau 501.330,
7 avenue Jean Capelle, 69621 Villeurbanne Cedex, France.
Courriel / Email : infomaths@univ-lyon1.fr
Téléphone / Phone : +33 (0)4 72 43 80 46
Site web / Website : http://edinfomaths.universite-lyon.fr